

Review of research in English as an Additional Language (EAL)

Professor Richard Andrews, Institute of Education,
University of London

Report produced by the Institute of
Education under contract from the Training
and Development Agency for Schools



Leading education
and social research
Institute of Education
University of London

Report produced by Institute of Education under contract from Training and Development Agency for Schools.

For information on alternative formats, or to give feedback on the content and accessibility of this publication, please contact:

Publications
NRDC
Institute of Education
20 Bedford Way
London WC1H 0AL
Telephone: +44 (0)20 7612 6476
Fax: +44 (0)20 7612 6671
Email: publications@nrdc.org.uk

Crown Copyright © 2009

Extracts from this publication may be used or reproduced for non-commercial, research, teaching or training purposes on condition that the source is acknowledged.

Contents

Acknowledgements.....	4
Introduction	5
The research review	6
Aims.....	6
Research questions	6
Search strategy.....	6
Collection, analysis and synthesis of the data	7
Findings	8
What are the gaps?	9
References	10
Appendix 1: Bibliography of sources.....	11
Appendix 2: Map of the field.....	20
Appendix 3: Search strategy for the review.....	46

Acknowledgements

I wish to thank Alison Robinson for her part in designing the search strategy for the review and in locating many of the studies that were accessed. She also composed the bibliography. Dina Medmedbegovic and Catherine Wallace helped with the identification of sources through hand searching.

Introduction

The Training and Development Agency has commissioned the Institute of Education, working with the Learning and Skills Network, to advise them on the development of a national school workforce strategy for EAL. This strategy will set out a vision for the next five years in which every EAL learner is supported in achieving their full potential, and every member of the teaching workforce is appropriately equipped to enable them to contribute in making this vision a reality.

The strategy will be far-reaching, affecting all members of the teaching workforce across all key stages; those who have a classroom role (teaching and supporting learning), including EAL specialists and mainstream staff, as well as school leaders. It will have a significant impact on teacher training providers, quality assurance agencies and all those who support schools. Chief among these are Local Authorities, who already play a key role in EAL provision and will have an equally significant role to play in the implementation of the strategy.

TDA has identified that there is a need for policy and practice to change. The population of EAL learners in England has increased consistently in recent years and with it demand for different types of EAL provision linked to new patterns of immigration. According to NALDIC figures from the 2008 school census indicate that EAL pupil numbers rose by approximately 25% between 2004 and 2008 to stand at 824,380, while the number of specialist EAL/EMA teachers has increased by just 8% during the same period. These figures demonstrate the mismatch in the system between demand and the available specialist workforce. This discrepancy results in additional pressures for the teaching workforce at all levels and undermines the principles of inclusion and equality of opportunity for EAL learners.

In order to provide an evidence base for the development of this strategy extensive research was carried out by the project team in the period of November 2008 to April 2009. It had four strands and used a range of methods and approaches:

- **A research review** mapping the national and international relevant research since 2000;
- **Case studies** of EAL provision in schools collected in a variety of settings;
- **Interviews** with a group of experts in education and a written consultation with a group of EAL specialists;
- **A National Online Survey** of the workforce.

A report on the Case Studies is now available as a separate document at www.teachingEAL.org.uk.

The research review

Aims

To map existing academic knowledge of the field of EAL it was necessary to undertake a scoping study to see what research was available on the topic. A scoping study (see Torgerson 2003, 27-8) maps the research that is published. It does not review it in depth: that will come later, given time and resources. The value of the scoping study is that it can give early shape to the foundation for the rest of the project (both in research and policy terms) and, crucially, identify gaps in the field.

The aim of this scoping study was to identify research that has been undertaken with regard to EAL provision and the teacher workforce, and also to identify gaps in research (and where possible, gaps in provision).

Research questions

The research questions that it set out to address were:

- What research has been undertaken on the impact of EAL provision in the school sector in the UK and elsewhere?
- What research is there on the nature and/or efficacy of the teacher workforce in EAL in the UK and elsewhere?
- What gaps are there in terms of research and provision?

Search strategy

The research in the wider project focuses primarily on the UK, but as part of the scoping review, we looked internationally at sources of research to identify relevant practice. However, we kept strictly to the practice of English as an Additional Language (EAL) or its equivalent term in the USA, English Language Learners (ELL), rather than include the broader and different categories and fields of English Language Teaching (ELT), English as a Foreign Language (EFL), English as a Second Language (ESL) or English to Speakers of Other Languages (ESOL). The focus of the review is on the politically-informed notion of English as an Additional Language as taught in schools in the UK, but with light shed upon it from international perspectives. A number of key words were selected as part of the search strategy:

- English as an additional language
- EAL
- ELL (English Language Learner)
- Teacher
- classroom assistant
- England,

- Bilingual
- Plurilingual

We sought research that:

1. had been published since 2000
2. was in the English language, and about the teaching of English
3. used any research methodology and method, including descriptive case study accounts and systematic reviews
4. looked at the impact of EAL and ELL provision
5. looked at the nature and/or efficacy of the teacher workforce (teaching assistants, teachers, managers)
6. was concerned with the school sector (i.e. 3-16).

We also selected exclusion criteria; these largely reflect the inclusion criteria. They are useful in identifying and selecting research. Specifically, we did not look at research that:

1. was published before 2000
2. was in languages other than English; or was about the teaching of languages other than English, except in bilingual or multilingual contexts
3. was identified as ELT, ESL, ESOL or EFL.
4. dealt with provision outside the 3-16 age range
5. did not address the teacher workforce
6. was not research, i.e. does not contribute to new knowledge and does not give an account of its methodology and/or methods.

Collection, analysis and synthesis of the data

The Educational Resources Information Center (ERIC); PsycINFO; the Campbell Collaboration Social, Psychological, Educational Criminological Trials Register (C2SPECTR); the British Education Index; and other electronic databases were searched. All searches were for the period 2000-2008 inclusive. A hand search was also conducted, based on the expertise and advice of those within the project team and within NALDIC. See Appendix 3.

The initial searching was by title and abstract. A screening exercise of titles and abstracts was undertaken, erring on the side of inclusion. A bibliography of included and excluded studies has been composed and is attached as Appendix 1. Following screening, a map of the field was drawn up and gaps in the literature were identified.

A judgement will be made, in due course, as to whether to undertake any in-depth analysis of the full texts of research studies. With a small number of relevant studies, it would be possible to undertake a narrative synthesis early in the project. With a larger number, the in-depth analysis could run alongside the rest of the research and be published in the final research report in September 2009.

The map did, in fact, reveal a larger (50+) number of studies for inclusion. This meant that an early synthesis was not possible, but the present interim summary has been

composed to give an indication of what research has taken place, what it suggests, and where the gaps are.

Findings

To date, 54 studies have been identified in the period from 2000 to 2008 that begin to provide a research basis for the future development of English as an Additional Language for the school workforce. These are listed and described briefly in Appendix 2.

The indications from the research to date are that there are ten major areas that need to be addressed:

1. a policy framework that sets out curricular and assessment standards and requirements for EAL development (Butcher et al. 2007, Christensen and Stanat 2007, Murakami 2008, Wallen and Kelly-Holmes 2006)
2. a knowledge base for teachers that includes cultural, linguistic and cognitive dimensions (Christensen and Stanat 2007, Dresser 2007, Flynn 2007, Karabenick and Noda 2004, Leung and Creese 2008) including:
3. language proficiency (Paneque and Barbetta 2006)
 - a. an understanding that many of the language strategies used for EAL teaching are good for English as a mother tongue learners too (Facella et al. 2005, Yoon 2007)
 - b. training in the distinctions between EAL and EAL with special needs, (Layton et al. 2002)
4. bridging of the divide between schools and the community (Conteh et al. 2007, Guo and Mohan 2008, Karabenick and Noda 2004) so that:
 - a. there is a move away from a deficit model of EAL (Conteh et al. 2007, Parke et al. 2002) towards high expectations (Olson and Land 2007)
 - b. the full range of linguistic and cultural competence is taken into account in designing literacy interventions in classrooms (Wallace 2005)
 - c. there is recognition that national policy needs to be interpreted locally (Creese 2003, Leung and Creese 2008)
5. bilingualism needs to be encouraged from an early age (Kenner 2004), where possible, and the fact that bilingual pupils are better at some aspects of English than others needs to be recognized and built upon (Cameron and Besser 2004, Robertson 2006, Wiese 2004)
6. there needs to be a move towards a plurilinguism in policy and practice (Mehmedbegovic 2007)
7. mainstreaming of EAL pupils must be retained as a principle (Hite and Evans 2006) with high expectations and sufficient language support (Chen 2007)
8. models of partnership between EAL specialists and curriculum content specialists need to be developed, moving from support through transmitter/explainer and interpreter modes to a full partnership model (Creese 2004, 2006; Gardner 2006)

9. the importance of oral communication must be recognized, in more than one language (Conteh 2007, Estrada 2005, Fumoto et al. 2007)
10. the importance of developing academic registers specific to academic success for EAL pupils must be recognized (Kotler et al. 2001)
11. assessment frameworks for EAL development and achievement are needed (Rea-Dickins 2001), with:
 - a. distinctions between summative and formative assessment clearly made (Leung and Rea-Dickins 2007)
 - b. more sensitivity to context (Teasdale and Leung 2000, Walters 2007)
 - c. awareness of the potential for learning of assessment models and encounters (Rea-Dickins 2006)
 - d. distinctions between language learning needs, special educational needs and curriculum content needs made (Rea-Dickins 2001)
 - e. lessons learnt from successful models in the USA and Australia (Scott and Erduran 2004)

What are the gaps?

There are a number of gaps in the research that has been published since 2000. These can be identified as follows:

1. although there is plenty of policy analysis, there is little research that addresses pedagogic practices in EAL teaching. Most classroom-based research is small-scale, based on teacher perceptions, and/or anecdotal. While there is a place for such research, there is a distinct lack of:
 - a. larger-scale studies
 - b. longitudinal studies
 - c. studies with a balance of qualitative and quantitative data
 - d. comparative studies
2. as a reflection of (1), there are few accounts of learning¹, other than individual case studies. Again, with regard to learning, there is a distinct lack of:
 - a. larger-scale studies
 - b. longitudinal studies
 - c. studies with a balance of qualitative and quantitative data
 - d. comparative studies
3. most of the research appears to be focussed on the early years and on primary education. There is a gap in studies that focus on the 11-18 age group.
4. there is little or no research or analysis on routes into EAL teaching, or on the continuing professional development needs of teachers in this respect.
5. because it is a relatively new field, there is little research on plurilingualism and its practices and/or policies.

¹ Learning, *per se*, fell outside the remit of the present review if it did not implicate teaching and teachers.

References

Torgerson, C. (2003) *Systematic Reviews* London: Continuum

Appendix 1: Bibliography of sources

Studies included in the map

Barnard, C. and Burgess, J. (2001) Secondary INSET in the Mainstream Education of Bilingual Pupils in England. *Journal of In-service Education*, 27(2): 323-52.

Bezemer, J. (2007) "They don't have that feeling": The Attribution of Linguistic Resources to Multilingual Students in a Primary School. *Linguistics and Education: An International Research Journal*, 18(1): 65-78.

Butcher, J., Sinka, I. and Troman, G. (2007) Exploring Diversity: Teacher Education Policy and Bilingualism. *Research Papers in Education*, 22(4): 483-501.

Cameron, L. and Besser S. (2004) *Writing in English as an Additional Language at Key Stage 2*. Department for Education and Skills, Nottingham, 137 p.

Chen, Y. (2007) Equality and Inequality of Opportunity in Education: Chinese Emergent Bilingual Children in the English Mainstream Classroom. *Language, Culture and Curriculum*, 20(1): 36-51.

Christensen, G. and Stanat, P. (2007) *Language policies and practices for helping immigrants and second generation students succeed*. Migration Policy Institute/Berelsmann Stiftung (The Transatlantic Task Force on Immigration and Integration). 16 p.

Conteh, J. (2000) Multilingual Classrooms Standards and Quality: Three Children and a Lot of Bouncing Balls. *Language and Education*, 14(1): 1-17.

Conteh, J. (2007) Opening Doors to Success in Multilingual Classrooms: Bilingualism, Codeswitching and the Professional Identities of Ethnic Minority Primary Teachers. *Language and Education*, 21(6): 457- 472.

Conteh, J., Martin, P. and Robertson, L.H. (eds) (2007) *Multilingual Learning: Stories from Schools and Communities in Britain*. Stoke-on-Trent: Trentham Books.

Cortazzi, M. and Jin, L. (2007) Narrative Learning, EAL and Metacognitive Development. *Early Child Development and Care*, 177(6-7): 645-660.

Creese, A. (2003) Language, Ethnicity, and the Mediation of Allegations of Racism: Negotiating Diversity and Sameness in Multilingual School Discourses. *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*, 6(3-4): 221-36.

Creese, A. (2004) Bilingual Teachers in Mainstream Secondary School Classrooms: Using Turkish for Curriculum Learning. *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*, 7(2-3): 189-203.

Creese, A. (2006) Supporting Talk? Partnership Teachers in Classroom Interaction. *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*, 9(4): 434-453.

- Dresser, R. (2007) The Effects of Teacher Inquiry in the Bilingual Language Arts Classroom. *Teacher Education Quarterly*, 34(3): 53-66.
- Estrada, P. (2005) The Courage to Grow: A Researcher and Teacher Linking Professional Development with Small-Group Reading Instruction and Student Achievement. *Research in the Teaching of English*, 39(4): 320-364.
- Facella, M.A., Rampino, K.M. and Shea, E.K. (2005) Effective Teaching Strategies for English Language Learners. *Bilingual Research Journal*, 29(1): 209-221.
- Flynn, N. (2007) Good Practice for Pupils Learning English as an Additional Language: Lessons from Effective Literacy Teachers in Inner-City Primary Schools. *Journal of Early Childhood Literacy*, 7(2): 177-198.
- Fumoto, H., Hargreaves, D.J. and Maxwell, S. (2007) Teachers' Perceptions of Their Relationships with Children Who Speak English as an Additional Language in Early Childhood Settings. *Journal of Early Childhood Research*, 5(2): 135-153.
- Gardner, S. (2004) Four Critical Features of Teacher-Guided Reporting in Infant Science and Literacy Contexts. *Language and Education*, 18(5): 361-378.
- Gardner, S. (2006) Centre-Stage in the Instructional Register: Partnership Talk in Primary EAL. *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*, 9(4): 476-494.
- Gardner, S. and Rea-Dickins, P. (2001) Conglomeration or Chameleon? Teachers' Representations of Language in the Assessment of Learners with English as an Additional Language. *Language Awareness*, 10(2-3): 161-77.
- Gersten, R. and Baker, S. (2000) What We Know about Effective Instructional Practices for English Language Learners. *Exceptional Children*, 66(4): 454-70.
- Guo, Y. and Mohan, B. (2008) ESL Parents and Teachers: Towards Dialogue. *Language and Education*, 22(1): 17-33.
- Hite, C.E. and Evans, L.S. (2006) Mainstream First-Grade Teachers' Understanding of Strategies for Accommodating the Needs of English Language Learners. *Teacher Education Quarterly*, 33(2): 89-110.
- Karabenick, S.A. and Noda, P.A.C. (2004) Professional Development Implications of Teachers' Beliefs and Attitudes toward English Language Learners. *Bilingual Research Journal*, 28(1): 55-75.
- Kenner, C. (2004) *Becoming Biliterate: Young children learning different writing systems*. Stoke-on-Trent: Trentham Books
- Kotler, A., Wegerif, R. and LeVoi, M. (2001) Oracy and the educational achievement of pupils with English as an additional language: The impact of bringing "talking partners" into Bradford schools. *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*, 4(6): 403-419.
- Layton, C.A. and Lock, R.H. (2002) Sensitizing Teachers to English Language Learner Evaluation Procedures for Students with Learning Disabilities. *Teacher Education and Special Education*, 25(4): 362-367.

- Leung, C. and Creese, A. (2008) Professional Issues in Working with Ethno-linguistic Difference: inclusive policy in practice. In Murray, D.E. (ed.) *Planning Change, Changing Plans: Innovations in second language teaching*, Ann Arbor MI: The University of Michigan press, 155-73.
- Leung, C. and Rea-Dickins, P. (2007) Teacher Assessment as Policy Instrument: Contradictions and Capacities. *Language Assessment Quarterly*, 4(1): 6-36.
- Low, G. and Bevertson, S. (2004) ICT, literacy learning and ESL learners. In Andrews, R. (ed.) (2004) *The Impact of ICT on Literacy Education* London: Routledge, 91-123.
- Mehmedbegovic, D. (2007) "Miss, who needs the languages of immigrants?" London's multilingual schools. In, Brighouse, T. and Fullick, L. (eds.) *Education in a Global City: Essays for London*. London: IOE publications, 221-52.
- Mickan, P. (2007) Doing Science and Home Economics: Curriculum Socialisation of New Arrivals in Australia. *Language and Education*, 21(2): 107-123.
- Murakami, C. (2008) "Everybody is just fumbling along": An Investigation of Views Regarding EAL Training and Support Provisions in a Rural Area. *Language and Education*, 4: 265-282.
- Olson, C.B. and Land, R. (2007) A Cognitive Strategies Approach to Reading and Writing Instruction for English Language Learners in Secondary School. *Research in the Teaching of English*, 41(3): 269-303.
- Paneque, O.M. and Barbeta, P.M. (2006) A Study of Teacher Efficacy of Special Education Teachers of English Language Learners with Disabilities. *Bilingual Research Journal*, 30:1, 171-193.
- Parke, T., et al. (2002) Revealing Invisible Worlds: Connecting the Mainstream with Bilingual Children's Home and Community Learning. *Journal of Early Childhood Literacy*, 2(2): 195-220.
- Purdy, J. (2008) Inviting Conversation: Meaningful Talk about Texts for English Language Learners. *Literacy*, 42(1): 44-51.
- Rea-Dickins, P. (2001) Mirror, Mirror on the Wall: Identifying Processes of Classroom Assessment. *Language Testing*, 18(4): 429-62.
- Rea-Dickins, P. (2006) Currents and Eddies in the Discourse of Assessment: A Learning-Focused Interpretation. *International Journal of Applied Linguistics*, 16(2): 163-188.
- Robertson, L.H. (2006) Learning to Read Properly by Moving Between Parallel Literacy Classes. *Language and Education*, 20(1): 44-61.
- Robinson, P. (2005) Teaching Key Vocabulary in Geography and Science Classrooms: An Analysis of Teachers' Practice with Particular Reference to EAL Pupils' Learning. *Language and Education*, 19(5): 428-445.
- Ryu, J. (2004) The Social Adjustment of Three, Young, High-Achieving Korean-English Bilingual Students in Kindergarten. *Early Childhood Education Journal*, 32(3): 165-171.

Scott, C. (2007) Stakeholder Perceptions of Test Impact. *Assessment in Education: Principles, Policy and Practice*, 14(1): 27-49.

Scott, C. and Erduran, S. (2004) Learning from International Frameworks for Assessment: EAL Descriptors in Australia and the USA. *Language Testing*, 21(3): 409-431.

Teasdale, A. and Leung, C. (2000) Teacher Assessment and Psychometric Theory: A Case of Paradigm Crossing? *Language Testing*, 17(2): 163-84.

Varghese, M. and Stritikus, T. (2005) "Nadie me dijo [Nobody told me]": Language Policy Negotiation and Implications for Teacher Education. *Journal of Teacher Education*, 56(1): 73-87.

Wallace, C. (2005) Conversations Around the Literacy Hour in a Multilingual London Primary School. *Language and Education*, 19(4): 322-338.

Wallen, M. and Kelly-Holmes, H. (2006) "I think they just think its going to go away at some stage": Policy and Practice in Teaching EAL in Irish Primary Schools. *Language and Education*, 20(2): 141-161.

Walters, S. (2007) How Do You Know that He's Bright but Lazy? Teachers' Assessments of Bangladeshi English as an Additional Language for Pupils in Two Year Three Classrooms. *Oxford Review of Education*, 33(1): 87-101.

Waxman, H.C. and Tellez, K. (2002) *Research Synthesis on Effective Teaching Practices for English Language Learners*. Report: ED474821, LSS Publication Series 2002-03. 56 p.

Wiese, A.M. (2004) Bilingualism and Biliteracy for All? *Language and Education*, 18(1): 69-92.

Yoon, B. (2007) Offering or Limiting Opportunities: Teachers' Roles and Approaches to English-Language Learners' Participation in Literacy Activities. *Reading Teacher*, 61(3): 216-225.

Yoon, B. (2008) Uninvited Guests: The Influence of Teachers' Roles and Pedagogies on the Positioning of English Language Learners in the Regular Classroom. *American Educational Research Journal*, 45(2): 495-522.

Full texts screened but not included in map

Arkoudis, S. (2003) Teaching English as a Second Language in Science Classes: Incommensurate Epistemologies. *Language and Education*, 17(3): 161-173.

Arnold, R. (2003) *Good practice in Scotland*. Series Note: EMIE Report, 2003. Slough: National Foundation for Educational Research, 33 p.

Avalos, M.A., et al. (2007) Modified Guided Reading: Gateway to English as a Second Language and Literacy Learning. *Reading Teacher*, 61(4): 318-329.

- Bello, M., et al. (2003) Basal readers and English language learners: A content analysis study. *Reading Research and Instruction*, 42(2): 1-15.
- Black, S. (2005) Easing ESL Students into Learning English Well. *Education Digest: Essential Readings Condensed for Quick Review*, 71(1): 36-40.
- Brindley, G. (2007) Editorial. *Language Assessment Quarterly*, 4(1): 1-5.
- Brooks, V., Abbott, I. and Bills, L. (2004) *Preparing to Teach in Secondary Schools*. Open University Press, 376 p.
- Brown, C.L. (2007) Supporting English Language Learners in Content-Reading. *Reading Improvement*, 44(1): 32-39.
- Conteh, J. (2003) *Succeeding in Diversity: Culture, Language and Learning in Primary Classrooms*. Stoke-on-Trent: Trentham Books.
- de Jong, E.J. and Harper, C.A. (2005) Preparing Mainstream Teachers for English-Language Learners: Is Being a Good Teacher Good Enough? *Teacher Education Quarterly*, 32(2): 101-124.
- Gandara, P., Maxwell-Jolly, J. and Driscoll, A. (2005) *Listening to Teachers of English Language Learners: A Survey of California Teachers' Challenges, Experiences, and Professional Development Needs*. Policy Analysis for California Education (PACE), 32 p.
- Haneda, M. and Wells, G. (2008) Learning an additional language through dialogic inquiry. *Language and Education*, 22(2): 114-136.
- Harper, C. and de Jong, E. (2004) Misconceptions about Teaching English-Language Learners. *Journal of Adolescent and Adult Literacy*, 48(2): 152-162.
- Helman, L.A. (2005) Using Literacy Assessment Results to Improve Teaching for English-Language Learners. *Reading Teacher*, 58(7): 668-677.
- Hill, J.D. and Flynn, K. (2008) Asking the Right Questions: Teachers' Questions Can Build Students' English Language Skills. *Journal of Staff Development*, 29(1): 46-52.
- Hirst, E. (2003) Diverse Voices in a Second Language Classroom. *Language and Education*, 17(3): 174-191.
- Hornberger, N.H. (2006) Discursive Approaches to Understanding Teacher Collaboration: Policy into Practice. *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*, 9(4): 495-499.
- Huang, J. (2004) Socialising ESL Students in the Discourse of School Science through Academic Writing. *Language and Education*, 18(2): 97-123.
- Kenner, C. (2007) *Home Pages: Literacy Links for Bilingual Children*. Stoke-on-Trent: Trentham Books.
- Knowles, G. (2006) *Supporting Inclusive Practice*. David Fulton Publishers, 220 p.
- Lenski, S.D., et al. (2006) Assessing English-Language Learners in Mainstream Classrooms. *Reading Teacher*, 60(1): 24-34.

- Leung, C. (2005) Language and Content in Bilingual Education. *Linguistics and Education: An International Research Journal*, 16(2): 238-252.
- Leung, C. (2001) English as an Additional Language: Focus or Diffused Curriculum Concerns. *Language and Education*, 15(1): 33-55.
- Palmer, B.C., et al. (2007) Bridging Two Worlds: Reading Comprehension, Figurative Language Instruction, and the English-Language Learner. *Journal of Adolescent and Adult Literacy*, 50(4): 258-267.
- Pardini, P. (2006) In One Voice: Mainstream and ELL Teachers Work Side-by-Side in the Classroom, Teaching Language through Content. *Journal of Staff Development*, 27(4): 20-25.
- Slavin, R.E. and Cheung, A. (2005) A Synthesis of Research on Language of Reading Instruction for English Language Learners. *Review of Educational Research*, 75(2): 247-284.
- Smith, H. (2006) Playing to Learn: A Qualitative Analysis of Bilingual Pupil-Pupil Talk During Board Game Play. *Language and Education*, 20(5): 415-437.
- Sneddon R. (2008) Magda and Albana: learning to read with dual language books. *Language and Education*, 22(2): 137-154.
- Vaughn, S., et al. (2006) Effectiveness of Spanish Intervention for First-Grade English Language Learners at Risk for Reading Difficulties. *Journal of Learning Disabilities*, 39(1): 56-73.
- Vine, E. (2006) 'Hospital': A Five Year Old Samoan Boy's Access to Learning Curriculum Content in his New Zealand Classroom. *Language and Education*, 20(3): 232-254.

Full texts obtained but not screened

- NWREL (2004) English Language Learner (ELL) Programs at the Secondary Level in Relation to Student Performance. Northwest Regional Educational Laboratory (NWREL), 218 p.
- Bernhard, J.K., Diaz, C.F. and Allgood, I. (2005) Research-Based Teacher Education for Multicultural Contexts. *Intercultural Education*, 16(3): 263-277.
- Cadiero-Kaplan, K. and Rodriguez, J.L. (2008) The Preparation of Highly Qualified Teachers for English Language Learners: Educational Responsiveness for Unmet Needs. *Equity and Excellence in Education*, 41(3): 372-387.
- Chen, C.-T., Kyle, D.W. and McIntyre, E. (2008) Helping Teachers Work Effectively with English Language Learners and Their Families. *School Community Journal*, 18(1): 7-20.
- Cheung, A. and Slavin, R.E. (2005) Effective Reading Programs for English Language Learners and Other Language Minority Students. *Success for All Foundation*, 35 p.

de Oliveira, L.C. and Athanases, S.Z. (2007) Graduates' Reports of Advocating for English Language Learners. *Journal of Teacher Education*, 58(3): 202-215.

Hamilton, K. (2006) Bilingual or Immersion? Diverse: Issues in Higher Education, 23(5): 23-26.

Hatch, T., White, M.E. and Capitelli, S. (2005) Learning from Teaching: What's Involved in the Development of Classroom Practice? *Cambridge Journal of Education*, 35(3): 323-331.

Hayes, K. and Salazar, J.J. (2001) Evaluation of the Structured English Immersion Program. Final Report: Year I. Report: ED462009, 80 p.

Hoag, L. (2004) The LSS Review. Volume 3, Number 1. Laboratory for Student Success (LSS), The Mid-Atlantic Regional Educational Laboratory, 20 p.

Honigsfeld, A. and Cohan, A. (2006) Lesson Study Meets SIOP: Linking Two Successful Professional Development Models. Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the American Educational Research Association (AERA), San Francisco, CA, April 11 2006.

Janzen, J. (2007) Preparing Teachers of Second Language Reading. *TESOL Quarterly*, 41(4): 707-729.

Lee, S., Butler, M. and Tippins, D. (2007) A case study of an early childhood teacher's perspective on working with English language learners. *Multicultural Education*, 15(1), 43-9.

Li, G. (2004) Perspectives on Struggling English Language Learners: Case Studies of Two Chinese-Canadian Children. *Journal of Literacy Research*, 36(1): 31-72.

McLaughlin, B., August, D. and Snow, C. (2000) Vocabulary Knowledge and Reading Comprehension in English Language Learners. Final Performance Report. Report: ED457696, 46 p.

Pawan, F. (2008) Content-Area Teachers and Scaffolded Instruction for English Language Learners. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 24(6): 1450-1462.

Reeves, J. (2004) "Like Everybody Else": Equalizing Educational Opportunity for English Language Learners. *TESOL Quarterly*, 38(1): 43-66.

Salami, L.O. (2008) It Is Still "Double Take": Mother Tongue Education and Bilingual Classroom Practice in Nigeria. *Journal of Language, Identity, and Education*, 7(2): 91-112.

Thomason, J.E. (2003) Improving Bilingual Student Learning and Thinking Skills Through the Use of the Constructivist Theory. Report: ED479390, 93 p.

Full texts sought, but unavailable or not obtained within timescale of review

Bourne, J. (2001) Doing What Comes Naturally: How the Discourses and Routines of Teachers' Practice Constrain Opportunities for Bilingual Support in UK Primary Schools. *Language and Education*, 15(4): 250-278.

Cirino, P.T., et al. (2007) Teacher Characteristics, Classroom Instruction, and Student Literacy and Language Outcomes in Bilingual Kindergartens. *Elementary School Journal*, 107(4): 341-364.

Cummins, J. (2001) *Language, Power and Ideology* Clevedon: Multilingual Matters.

Cummins, J., Chow, P. and Schechter, S.R. (2006) Community as Curriculum. *Language Arts*, 83(4): 297-307.

Dewaele, J.M., Housen, A and Wei, L. (eds) (2003) *Bilingualism beyond Basic Principles* Clevedon: Multilingual Matters.

Drury, R. (2007) *Young Bilingual Learners at Home and School: researching multilingual voices* Stoke-on-Trent: Trentham Books.

Ehlers-Zavala, F.P. (2008) *Teaching adolescent English language learners*. In Lenski, S. and Lewis, J. (eds.), *Reading success for struggling adolescent learners*. New York: Guilford Press, pp. 74-89.

Ernst-Slavit, G. and Wenger, K.J. (2006) Teaching in the Margins: The Multifaceted Work and Struggles of Bilingual Paraeducators. *Anthropology and Education Quarterly*, 37(1): 62-81.

Gambrell, L.B., et al. (2006) *Best Practices in Literacy Instruction. Third Edition*. Guilford Publications, 408 p.

Gandara, P. and Maxwell-Jolly, J. (2000) *Preparing Teachers for Diversity: A Dilemma of Quality and Quantity. Teaching and California's Future*. Report: ED458201, 29p.

Gebhard, M., Harman, R. and Seger, W. (2007) Reclaiming Recess: Learning the Language of Persuasion. *Language Arts*, 84(5): 419-430.

Graham, S., MacArthur, C.A. and Fitzgerald, J. (2007) *Best Practices in Writing Instruction. Solving Problems in the Teaching of Literacy*. Guilford Publications, 354p.

Latham, D. (2002) *How Children Learn To Write: Supporting and Developing Children's Writing in School*. Report: ED472146, 212 p.

Lee, S., Butler, M.B. and Tippins, D.J. (2007) A Case Study of an Early Childhood Teacher's Perspective on Working with English Language Learners. *Multicultural Education*, 15(1): 43-49.

Mueller, T.G., Singer, G.H.S. and Carranza, F.D. (2006) Planning and Language Instruction Practices for Students with Moderate to Severe Disabilities Who Are English Language Learners. *Research and Practice for Persons with Severe Disabilities*, 31(3): 242-254.

Sweet, A.P. and Snow, C.E. (2003) *Rethinking Reading Comprehension. Solving Problems in the Teaching of Literacy*. Report: ED481439, 243 pp.

Appendix 2: Map of the field

Reference for study	Focus of study (EAL, ELL), including age group if noted	Research methodology and methods used	Pedagogy and/or impact – results	Nature and/or efficacy of the teacher workforce – results and implications
Barnard, C. and Burgess, J. (2001) 'Secondary INSET in the Mainstream Education of Bilingual Pupils in England'. <i>Journal of In-service Education</i> . 27:2, 323-52. (abstract only)	This article reports the findings of an impact study following the delivery of a series of GEST-funded INSET programmes for secondary teachers in a borough in the North West of England.	[Not clear from abstract]	"It summarises the research findings in three sub-sections: (i) the context within which the training was given; (ii) the perceived impact of the training; and (iii) the perceived need for further development."	"It concludes that the programmes achieved some limited success in modifying teachers' and schools' practice in relation to both provision for developing bilingual pupils and language issues across the curriculum, and recommends that more such training should be offered"
Bezemer, J. (2007) "They Don't Have that Feeling" the Attribution of Linguistic Resources to Multilingual Students in a Primary School'. <i>Linguistics and Education: An International Research Journal</i> , 18:1, 65-78.	Attribution of resources to multilingual children in a primary school in the Netherlands	Ethnographic study, drawing on interviews with teachers as to what they attribute to children in terms of linguistic performance	Discrepancy between what teachers attribute to multilingual children, and the children's actual linguistic resources gained as implied in classroom activities	Sees some degree of misattribution as inevitable, as teachers cannot help but generalise; but it argues for more varied pedagogic approaches, so that, for example, more involvement from learners can develop their language skills

Reference for study	Focus of study (EAL, ELL), including age group if noted	Research methodology and methods used	Pedagogy and/or impact – results	Nature and/or efficacy of the teacher workforce – results and implications
Butcher, J., Sinka, I. and Troman, G. (2007) 'Exploring Diversity: Teacher Education Policy and Bilingualism'. <i>Research Papers in Education</i> , 22:4, 483-501. (abstract only)	The authors' research investigated the way teacher education policy in England ignores the positive attributes of bilingual learners and the resultant lack of debate about the preparedness of trainee teachers to work effectively with bilingual pupils.	They interviewed trainees, teachers and Local Education Authority (LEA) officers, administered a questionnaire to trainees and analysed policy documents.	The findings indicate teacher education in England pays bilingualism lip service at best, persisting with a policy discourse emphasising the problem of EAL.	The research raises important questions concerning teacher education policy in relation to bilingualism, and highlights the significance of school contexts in relation to effective teacher preparation. The article concludes by arguing for policies to improve teacher confidence and competence in England's increasingly linguistically diverse classrooms.
Cameron, L. and Besser, S. (2004) <i>Writing in English as an additional language at Key Stage 2</i> , Department for Education and Skills, Nottingham, 137pp.	Extensive report, reviewing research in a policy context. Focuses on 'advanced learners' of English as an additional language, i.e. those who have been in the country for more than 5 years	Scripts of 264 pupils analysed quantitatively and qualitatively to identify features of writing that pupils learning EAL handle less well than native speakers/writers	EAL pupils handle a variety of genres, prepositions and the composition of short, fixed phrases less well than EMT pupils. Other features are handled less well by lower achieving EAL pupils. However, use of metaphor in the higher achieving EAL pupils was better handled than by EMT pupils.	Implications arising from all the points on the left: a need for attention to genres, short, fixed phrases and prepositions; modal verbs prepositional phrases and adverbials for EAL learners.

Reference for study	Focus of study (EAL, ELL), including age group if noted	Research methodology and methods used	Pedagogy and/or impact – results	Nature and/or efficacy of the teacher workforce – results and implications
<p>Chen, Y. (2007) 'Equality and Inequality of Opportunity in Education: Chinese Emergent Bilingual Children in the English Mainstream Classroom'. <i>Language, Culture and Curriculum</i>, 20:1, 36-51.</p>	<p>EAL learners within mainstream setting in English primary schools within a context of 'equal opportunities for all'</p>	<p>Participants include 3 8-11 year old children from two recently arrived Chinese families. Approach is largely ethnographic and case study-based.</p>	<p>The children studies seemed isolated within their mainstream classes. There were misunderstandings between teachers, parents and pupils as to what the provision was.</p>	<p>Questions the policy of mainstreaming EAL learners, arguing that this works only if there is sufficient language support. Teachers need to be fully aware of new arrivals' confidence and position in respect of their languages</p>
<p>Conteh, J. (2000) 'Multilingual classrooms, standards and quality: three children and a lot of bouncing balls'. <i>Language and Education</i>, 14:1, 1-17. (abstract only)</p>	<p>Primary age children in England tend to perform poorly in international comparisons of achievement, particularly in numeracy and literacy. Current ideologies framing attempts to raise standards in schools focus strongly on improving the quality of teaching, and are often based on a static, product-oriented model of teaching and learning.</p>	<p>Evidence gained from analysing the teacher-child and child-child talk collected as part of a longitudinal, ethnographic study of life in a vertically-grouped, Year 3/4 multilingual class in an inner-city first school in the north of England reveals the complex, subtle processes involved in the interactive negotiation of meanings between teachers and learners and the joint construction of a 'new' culture of learning.</p>	<p>The teachers are shown to be skilled managers and interpreters of these meanings and the children active and eager collaborators.</p>	<p>If evidence such as this is not taken into account in the design and planning of curriculum and assessment reform, the long-term effectiveness of the reform (i.e. National Strategies) will be called into question.</p>

Reference for study	Focus of study (EAL, ELL), including age group if noted	Research methodology and methods used	Pedagogy and/or impact – results	Nature and/or efficacy of the teacher workforce – results and implications
<p>Conteh, J. (2007) 'Opening Doors to Success in Multilingual Classrooms: Bilingualism, Codeswitching and the Professional Identities of Ethnic Minority Primary Teachers'. <i>Language and Education</i>, 21:6, 457-72. (abstract only)</p>	<p>This paper presents evidence from interviews with bilingual primary teachers which illustrates their views on issues of bilingualism, language choices and pedagogy in multilingual classrooms and the importance of recognising community resources.</p>	<p>An extended example of teacher–pupil interaction from a complementary classroom setting, showing codeswitching between English and Punjabi, is analysed and discussed using a sociocultural theory of learning which recognises the inseparability of language, culture and context and places emphasis on culture.</p>	<p>This keys into broader ideas about 'culturally responsive pedagogies'. It begins to show how codeswitching, as part of an 'additive bilingual' pedagogy, may have the potential to raise pupils' achievements.</p>	<p>Finally, while the focus of the paper is on bilingual teachers, the important roles played by all teachers in their pupils' success is recognised.</p>
<p>Conteh, J. Martin, P. and Robertson, L.H. (2007) <i>Multilingual Learning: stories from schools and communities in Britain</i>. Stoke-on-Trent: Trentham Books.</p>		<p>Ethnographic case studies of schools and communities in the UK</p>		<p>Argues for a move away from a deficit model for EAL; for a more contextualized community-based approach to language learning; for better links between out-of-school classes and in-school classes; for an understanding that supplementary schools may not necessarily be more traditional, pedagogically, than mainstream schools; and for policy to be formulated in a global context</p>

Reference for study	Focus of study (EAL, ELL), including age group if noted	Research methodology and methods used	Pedagogy and/or impact – results	Nature and/or efficacy of the teacher workforce – results and implications
Cortazzi, M. and Jin, L. (2007) 'Narrative Learning, EAL and Metacognitive Development'. <i>Early Child Development and Care</i> , 177:6-7, 645-660. (abstract only)	This paper elaborates some aspects of narrative learning - defined here as learning to tell stories and learning from, about and through narratives - in the context of primary-age pupils who use English as an Additional Language (EAL).	[Not available from abstract]	"We argue that linguistically orientated research on metacognitive strategy development is not necessarily readily applied to EAL learners. After presenting a background on narrative, narrative development and social aspects of telling stories, we introduce an approach to narrative development which encourages a cycle telling and retelling of stories which provides EAL learners with layered opportunities for developing the metacognitive features of planning, remembering, understanding and reflecting on storytelling."	The paper introduces some principles to support their language development in classroom interaction.

Reference for study	Focus of study (EAL, ELL), including age group if noted	Research methodology and methods used	Pedagogy and/or impact – results	Nature and/or efficacy of the teacher workforce – results and implications
<p>Creese, A. (2003) 'Language, Ethnicity, and the Mediation of Allegations of Racism: Negotiating Diversity and Sameness in Multilingual School Discourses'. <i>International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism</i>, 6: 3-4, 221-36.</p>	<p>Focuses on an alleged racist incident at a secondary school in London, involving Turkish-Kurdish and other students complaining against, and defending, attitudes by teachers within the school</p>	<p>Ethnography of communication: a study of two texts produced by students</p>		<p>The general point to emerge from this study is that general policies to suit all children and schools may not work in all situations, so a more nuanced appreciation of difference and diversity is needed for local contexts.</p>
<p>Creese, A. (2004) 'Bilingual Teachers in Mainstream Secondary School Classrooms: Using Turkish for Curriculum Learning'. <i>International Journal of Bilingual Education & Bilingualism</i>, 7:2/3, 189-203</p>	<p>Most bilingual teachers in the UK find themselves supporting EAL learners in an English-only environment in classrooms. There is very little bilingual teaching in UK schools. This study breaks the mould.</p>	<p>Ethnographic study of 6 bilingual English/Turkish speaking teachers in secondary schools in London, using observations, interviews, classroom transcripts, document analysis.</p>		<p>Teachers in the study resisted the idea of being supportive and subsidiary to the subject teachers, thus putting EAL learning and bilingual learning on a par with subject learning in secondary schools. Taking on the role of <i>transmitter</i> and <i>explainer</i> of curriculum content. Questions at the end whether a transmitter approach goes far enough, as it appears to reinforce conservative pedagogic patterns.</p>

Reference for study	Focus of study (EAL, ELL), including age group if noted	Research methodology and methods used	Pedagogy and/or impact – results	Nature and/or efficacy of the teacher workforce – results and implications
<p>Creese, A. (2006) 'Supporting Talk? Partnership Teachers in Classroom Interaction'. <i>International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism</i>, 9:4, 434-453.</p>	<p>Moving away from the one teacher-many children pattern in classrooms, this study looks at two teachers working together</p>	<p>Ethnography of communication: case study of a geography and an EAL teacher working together. Uses interviews and transcripts of classroom talk.</p>		<p>EAL work is seen as 'supporting' and not as important as subject-based or other pedagogical work in the classroom. This situation must change if EAL teaching is to get the recognition it deserves. A new dynamic is called for, with much more attention as to how teachers work together to support EAL students.</p>
<p>Dresser, R. (2007) 'The effects of teacher inquiry in the bilingual language arts classroom'. In <i>Teacher Education Quarterly</i>, summer 2007, 53-66.</p>	<p>Focuses on two questions: i) what are the effects of classroom inquiry in preparing teacher candidates to teach English language learners (ELLs)? and ii) what are the implications of classroom inquiry on academic language development and learning among ELLs?</p>	<p>Year long study (2003-4) on 9 bilingual teacher candidates (i.e. trainees) in a Spanish-English context in California.</p>	<p>Classroom inquiry had a positive effect on teacher candidates as well as on students, especially with regard to the development of academic language</p>	<p>Need for trainee teachers to know about interventions that improve their own understanding, and that of their students, in the demands of academic language for use in the classroom.</p>

Reference for study	Focus of study (EAL, ELL), including age group if noted	Research methodology and methods used	Pedagogy and/or impact – results	Nature and/or efficacy of the teacher workforce – results and implications
Estrada, P. (2005) 'The Courage to Grow: A Researcher and Teacher Linking Professional Development with Small-Group Reading Instruction and Student Achievement'. <i>Research in the Teaching of English</i> , 39:4, 320-364.	A two-way Spanish-English bilingual immersion first grade class with many ELLs in a low-performing, socially challenged school	Case study of a successful collaboration between a teacher and the author (a researcher)	Sustained content and pedagogy-centred professional development is needed; all stakeholders must face the fact of student performance levels; direct examination of pedagogy; developing teacher subject expertise	A focus on the oral strengths of pupils in a community is needed, so that learning can be built on a solid foundation
Facella, M.A., Rampino, K.M. and Shea, E.K. (2005) 'Effective Teaching Strategies for English Language Learners'. <i>Bilingual Research Journal</i> , 29:1, 209-221.	Declares that mainstreaming isn't necessarily working in the USA because of insufficient resources and training. Focuses on strategies used by teachers in mainstream classes to support ELL pupils	Interviews with 20 early childhood educators from two culturally and linguistically diverse communities in Massachusetts.		Main goal was to link content with language; the researchers found that many of the strategies successful for ELLs were also successful for EMT pupils, and that teachers should find out more about language learning strategies in general.

Reference for study	Focus of study (EAL, ELL), including age group if noted	Research methodology and methods used	Pedagogy and/or impact – results	Nature and/or efficacy of the teacher workforce – results and implications
<p>Flynn, N. (2007) 'Good Practice for Pupils Learning English as an Additional Language: Lessons from Effective Literacy Teachers in Inner-City Primary Schools'. <i>Journal of Early Childhood Literacy</i>, 7:2, 177-198</p>	<p>Focus on year 2 (6-7 year old) pupils in 2003 and 2005 in three inner-city primary schools.</p>	<p>Case studies of three effective teachers of literacy, including lesson observations and interviews with the teachers, their headteachers and EAL advisors</p>		<p>Common elements in successful practice emerged: lessons driven by pupil need; confidence in the teachers in the teaching of reading and writing and excellent subject knowledge; they adapted the prescribed pedagogy for the NLS; a suggestion that good teachers of EAL literacy are good teachers of literacy <i>per se</i></p>
<p>Fumoto, H., Hargreaves, D.J. and Maxwell, S. (2007) 'Teachers' Perceptions of Their Relationships with Children Who Speak English as an Additional Language in Early Childhood Settings'. <i>Journal of Early Childhood Research</i>, 5:2, 135-153.</p>	<p>The study focuses on teachers' perceptions of their relationships with children who speak English as an additional language in early childhood settings, as expressed in the title of the paper.</p>	<p>Focuses on 10 teachers and their 241 children, of whom 41 were EAL speakers. A Student-Teacher Relationship Scale was employed to gauge position.</p>	<p>Results showed significant improvement over the year: EAL students who scored lower on the STRS at the beginning of the school year were much higher on the scale by the end.</p>	<p>Results add support to the notion oral communication is important in language development and teacher-student relationships; as is sensitivity towards non-verbal expression.</p>

Reference for study	Focus of study (EAL, ELL), including age group if noted	Research methodology and methods used	Pedagogy and/or impact – results	Nature and/or efficacy of the teacher workforce – results and implications
<p>Gardner, S. (2004) 'Four critical features of teacher-guided reporting in infant science and literacy contexts'. <i>Language and Education</i>, 18:5, 361-78. (abstract only)</p>	<p>Gibbons, (1998, 2001a, 2002) argues that Teacher-Guided Reporting (TGR) is a familiar teaching stage with potential for the development of academic registers when there is linguistic task sequencing, significant student initiation, and press on linguistic resources. In exploring the potential of TGR as a formative assessment site for infant EAL, this paper examines Gibbons' claims in the context of science and literacy lessons.</p>	<p>Detailed analysis of three cycles of TGR in one literacy lesson shows an extended linguistic sequencing of tasks, with corresponding sequencing of student initiations.</p>	<p>It suggests that teachers more naturally (i.e. without TGR training) use TGR in experimental science lessons, despite the linguistic sequencing of stages in the literacy activity implemented. As too great a press on linguistic resources may be counterproductive, a fourth critical feature of TGR is suggested relating to deflection and whole-class engagement.</p>	<p>More research is needed to explore this through comparison with TGR in small group work and further investigation of learner perspectives. The lessons to be learnt here are largely pedagogic in relation to formative assessment.</p>
<p>Gardner, S. (2006) 'Centre-Stage in the Instructional Register: Partnership Talk in Primary EAL'. <i>International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism</i>, 9:4, 476-494.</p>	<p>Characterizes a move from support through collaborative to partnership talk in the classroom</p>	<p>Draws on Christie's theory of regulative and instructional registers, and looks at one Year 1 Social Studies class. Analyses classroom discourse.</p>	<p>Proposes and uses a framework for the analysis of partnership talk.</p>	<p>Sets out the case for full partnership teaching. Through partnership teachers discover and take on the pedagogic and linguistic expertise of the partner.</p>

Reference for study	Focus of study (EAL, ELL), including age group if noted	Research methodology and methods used	Pedagogy and/or impact – results	Nature and/or efficacy of the teacher workforce – results and implications
<p>Gardner, S. and P. Rea-Dickins, (2001) 'Conglomeration or Chameleon? Teachers' Representations of Language in the Assessment of Learners with English as an Additional Language'. <i>Language Awareness</i>, 10:2-3, 161-77.</p>	<p>Investigates teacher representations of language in relation to assessment contexts – part of research into the language assessment of 5-7 year olds in EAL.</p>	<p>Interviews with teachers; transcripts of lessons and classroom-based assessments; formal written profiles of children's language development and assessment; analysis of curriculum and policy documents.</p>	<p>No clear results as such; the limitations of the study, as an exploratory, pilot-like piece of research, are acknowledged.</p>	<p>Concludes that teachers are more chameleon-like than operating with a conglomeration of models; and that a framework needs to be developed to make sense of language development and assessment in EAL within language education.</p>
<p>Gersten, R. and Baker, S. (2000) 'What We Know about Effective Instructional Practices for English Language Learners'. <i>Exceptional Children</i>, 66:4, 454-70.</p>	<p>Investigates the knowledge base for effective instruction for ELLs in elementary and middle school grades</p>	<p>Research synthesis (9 intervention studies and 15 descriptive studies) using a 'qualitative multivocal method': interviews with professional educators and researchers around the USA in five groups</p>	<p>The knowledge base is "highly fragmented" with conceptual differences among scholars and researchers. But themes emerged, including the merging of English-language content with content-area learning; the close relationship between promising approaches and a knowledge base on effective teaching; and confusion about oral language use</p>	<p>Implications include a need for more intervention studies, especially for those with learning difficulties. Implications for policy and practice are not clear.</p>

Reference for study	Focus of study (EAL, ELL), including age group if noted	Research methodology and methods used	Pedagogy and/or impact – results	Nature and/or efficacy of the teacher workforce – results and implications
<p>Guo, Y. and Mohan, B. (2008) 'ESL parents and teachers: towards dialogue'. <i>Language and Education</i>, 22:1, 17-33. (abstract only)</p>	<p>Conflict and miscommunication between English as a Second Language (ESL) parents and teachers has had a major impact on educational policy, but few empirical studies examine it as discourse. This study examines communication between ESL parents and high school ESL teachers in a 'Parents' Night' (PN) event organised to increase understanding of the ESL programme.</p>	<p>It examines an intercultural communication view and a 'dialogue across differences' view, using a more comprehensive systemic functional linguistics view to describe the discourse of the event and locate it in its contexts.</p>	<p>It explores explanations for a conflict that occurred, draws implications about the role of each view and considers prospects for the future development of ESL parent-teacher communication.</p>	<p>The need for parents and teachers to work together on a common concern: the achievement of ELL students in mainstream classes.</p>
<p>Hite, C.E. and Evans, L.S. (2006) 'Mainstream first-grade teachers' understanding of strategies for accommodating the needs of English language learners'. In <i>Teacher Education Quarterly</i>, spring 2006, 89-110.</p>	<p>What do teachers understand about how to assist ELLs in gaining language, literacy and content knowledge?</p>	<p>Examines how 22 teachers at one grade level perceived the use of three instructional strategies. Uses surveys (22) and interviews (19) in rural and urban settings.</p>	<p>Six categories emerged from the data: adjustment of teaching approach; modifications issues; parent interactions; affect and classroom philosophy; peers as teachers; and use of L1</p>	<p>Three major conclusions/implications: i) strategies for mainstream students are compatible with those for ELL students; ii) high expectations of ELLs is important and iii) student-student interaction is important for language development</p>

Reference for study	Focus of study (EAL, ELL), including age group if noted	Research methodology and methods used	Pedagogy and/or impact – results	Nature and/or efficacy of the teacher workforce – results and implications
<p>Karabenick, S.A. and Noda, P.A.C. (2004) 'Professional Development Implications of Teachers' Beliefs and Attitudes toward English Language Learners'. <i>Bilingual Research Journal</i>, 28:1, 55-75.</p>	<p>Focuses on similarities and differences in teacher attitudes towards ELLs, bilingualism and bilingual education.</p>	<p>Researchers surveyed 729 teachers in one Midwestern suburban district with a recent history of immigration about their attitudes, beliefs, practices and needs.</p>	<p>In general, teachers held positive attitudes towards ELLs, bilingualism and bilingual education.</p>	<p>Pervasive need for professional development and training: specifically, cultural awareness and second language learning theory are required. Integration with assessment (of EAL) policies and practice essential, as are parental and community involvement.</p>
<p>Kenner, C. (2004) <i>Becoming Biliterate: young children learning different writing systems</i>. Stoke-on-Trent: Trentham Books.</p>	<p>A focus on biliteracy in the early years</p>	<p>Based on a research project with Gunther Kress et al.</p>		<p>Encourages biliteracy from an early age. "As many children as possible should have the opportunity to speak and write in different languages".</p>
<p>Kotler, A., Wegerif, R. and LeVoi, M. (2001) 'Oracy and the educational achievement of pupils with English as an additional language: The impact of bringing "talking partners" into Bradford schools'. <i>International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism</i>, 4:6, 403-419.</p>	<p>Hypothesis is that underperformance of EAL students results from a mismatch between registers used at home and those assumed in education. Bradford-based.</p>	<p>Method involved providing trained 'talking partners' for those EAL pupils identified as needing help. 64 pupils aged between 5 and 8 were selected, and their progress compared with a control group in similar schools.</p>	<p>Extra sessions made a difference to spoken English and thus to engagement in schooling more generally.</p>	<p>Developing registers specific to academic success is an important element in language education for EAL learners.</p>

Reference for study	Focus of study (EAL, ELL), including age group if noted	Research methodology and methods used	Pedagogy and/or impact – results	Nature and/or efficacy of the teacher workforce – results and implications
Layton, C.A. and Lock, R.H. (2002) 'Sensitizing teachers to English language learner evaluation procedures for students with learning disabilities'. In <i>Teacher Education and Special Education</i> , 25:4, 362-7.	Examines the effect of training on teachers' sensitivity to specific critical evaluation procedures useful in distinguishing the subtle differences between students who are ELLs and those who are ELLs with learning disabilities	Controlled trial (possibly randomised – unclear) using an intervention in the form of training materials		Explicit training in the differences between students who are ELLs and those who are ELLs with learning disabilities is important.
Leung, C. and Creese, A. (2008) 'Professional issues in working with ethno-linguistic difference: inclusive policy in practice'. In Murray, D.E. (ed.) (2008) <i>Planning Change, Changing Plans: innovations in second language teaching</i> . Ann Arbor: The University of Michigan Press.	Focuses on notions of linguistic difference and their place in mainstream classrooms; and on the conceptualisation of EAL and its perceived impact on students' intellectual development.	Two sets of teacher interview discourse data.		Need for a knowledge base for EAL rather than just 'sensitive encounters'. Also a need for a close look at policy and practice, in particular how policy is implemented in local responses.

Reference for study	Focus of study (EAL, ELL), including age group if noted	Research methodology and methods used	Pedagogy and/or impact – results	Nature and/or efficacy of the teacher workforce – results and implications
<p>Leung, C. and Rea-Dickins, P. (2007) 'Teacher assessment as policy instrument: contradictions and capacities'. In <i>Language Assessment Quarterly</i>, 4:1, 6-36.</p>	<p>Critique of assessment policy, arguing that policy is uninterested in technical and educational issues.</p>	<p>Critique supported by research</p>	<p>Narrow focus of current assessment regime does not do justice to the range of capabilities needed in English as an additional language.</p>	<p>Urgent need to clarify distinctions between summative and formative assessment, and between assessment for English and assessment for EAL. Also a need for clarity between a grammar-based view of English and a cross-curriculum and communication-oriented view.</p>
<p>Low, G. and Bevertson, S. (2004) 'ICT, literacy learning and ESL learners'. In Andrews, R. (ed.) (2004) <i>The Impact of ICT on Literacy Education</i> London: Routledge, 91-123.</p>	<p>Systematic review of the international research literature on ICT, literacy learning and ESL learners</p>	<p>EPPI-Centre based systematic review methodology</p>		<p>Provides useful clarification of terms EAL, ESL, EFL, bilingualism etc., and argues for further clarity in this field. As the foci of the chapter and book are on the impact of ICT, the rest of the chapter is less relevant to the present study.</p>
<p>Mehmedbegovic, D. (2007) "Miss, who needs the language of immigrants?" London's multilingual schools'. In Brighouse, T. and Fullick, L. (eds) (2007) <i>Education in a Global City: essays from London</i> London: IOE Publications, 221-52.</p>	<p>Policy and data review of period, largely from 2000, on language diversity in London schools</p>	<p>Policy and data review</p>		<p>A move towards plurilingualism, based on the rich variety of languages in London schools – but with implications for national policy.</p>

Reference for study	Focus of study (EAL, ELL), including age group if noted	Research methodology and methods used	Pedagogy and/or impact – results	Nature and/or efficacy of the teacher workforce – results and implications
<p>Mickan, P. (2007) 'Doing science and home economics: curriculum socialisation of new arrivals in Australia'. <i>Language and Education</i>, 21:2, 107-23. (abstract only)</p>	<p>This paper describes subject-specific teachers working with non-English-speaking immigrant students in a secondary school in South Australia.</p>	<p>It examines teachers' subject discourses as opportunities for students' apprenticeship into the practices of two secondary school curriculum subjects, science and home economics. The focus of this paper is on the way teachers' practices and discourses constructed specific cultural domains of the school curriculum for immigrant students.</p>	<p>In class, students experienced language in context, which served the social purposes of their community of practice. Teachers and students carried out practices of science and home economics with distinctive spoken and written discourses, which were linked with material and behavioural semiotic resources in the processes of instruction.</p>	<p>The study proposes that through their involvement in the social practices of content subjects, newcomers experience and are apprenticed into selected discourses for cultural participation in education. The study suggests that for new arrivals or immigrants, the curriculum experiences are engagements with cultural practices, which constitute part of their socialisation into new cultural contexts.</p>
<p>Murakami, C. (2008) 'Everybody is just fumbling along: an investigation of views regarding EAL training and support provisions in a rural area'. <i>Language and Education</i>, 4, 265-282.</p>	<p>Focuses on EAL primary school provision in a rural area in England that has experienced recent immigration</p>	<p>23 semi-structured and unstructured interviews with those involved in EAL teacher education</p>	<p>Neglect of EAL training, especially in those geographical areas where it is perceived that there is no 'need'. Teachers expected to 'learn on the job'.</p>	<p>The diffused nature of CPD is a problem. A range of nationally accredited PD courses must be developed; resources must be improved; and a highly classified EAL framework for teachers development is needed.</p>

Reference for study	Focus of study (EAL, ELL), including age group if noted	Research methodology and methods used	Pedagogy and/or impact – results	Nature and/or efficacy of the teacher workforce – results and implications
<p>Olson, C.B. and R. Land, (2007) 'A Cognitive Strategies Approach to Reading and Writing Instruction for English Language Learners in Secondary School'. <i>Research in the Teaching of English</i>, 41:3, 269-303.</p>	<p>California Writing Project in partnership with a district where 93% of the students were ELLs. Purpose of study was to examine reading and writing practices.</p>	<p>Over an 8 year period, a relatively stable group of 55 secondary teachers engaged in ongoing CPD in cognitive strategies were studied.</p>	<p>Students (n=2000) receiving cognitive strategies instruction significantly outgained peers for 7 consecutive years.</p>	<p>Findings “reinforce the importance of having high expectations for ELLs; exposing them to [a] rigorous language arts curriculum; explicitly teaching cognitive strategies to help them read and write about challenging texts; and involving students as partners in a community of learning” (p269).</p>
<p>Paneque, O.M. and Barbeta, P.M. (2006) 'A Study of Teacher Efficacy of Special Education Teachers of English Language Learners with Disabilities'. <i>Bilingual Research Journal</i>, 30:1, 171-193.</p>	<p>Examines efficacy of special education teachers of ELLs</p>	<p>Survey of 202 special education elementary school teachers</p>	<p>No significant differences were found for teacher preparation, years of service or socio-economic status of students; but language capability in students correlated with teacher perceptions of self-efficacy, where teachers also spoke those languages.</p>	<p>It is advantageous to be proficient in the languages of the students you teach; teachers who have such proficiency perceived themselves to be more efficacious.</p>
<p>Parke, T., et al. (2002) 'Revealing invisible worlds: Connecting the mainstream with bilingual children's home and community learning'. <i>Journal of Early Childhood Literacy</i>, 2:2, 195-220.</p>	<p>Focus on the positive capacities of bilingual pupils in the early years.</p>	<p>A series of case studies based on different but related projects; the article represents a distillation of views.</p>	<p>If teachers focus only on young bilinguals' performance in English, they are unlikely to appreciate the full range of their capacities, especially in terms of their plurilinguistic capacity.</p>	<p>A call for recognition of the range of languages that bilingual pupils bring to learning inside and outside the classroom.</p>

Reference for study	Focus of study (EAL, ELL), including age group if noted	Research methodology and methods used	Pedagogy and/or impact – results	Nature and/or efficacy of the teacher workforce – results and implications
Purdy, J. (2008) 'Inviting Conversation: Meaningful Talk about Texts for English Language Learners'. <i>Literacy</i> , 42:1, 44-51.	Investigation of dialogues between ELLs, native speaking children and a teacher in an urban grade 3 Canadian class. Socially situated learning approach.	Small-scale class-based case study, with open coding of transcribed conversations. Results generated from coding.	ELL children benefited most, with shaping and extending of their discourses and co-construction of meaning.	Four strategies emerged that seemed particularly helpful: questioning, teaching vocabulary, engaging in collaborative talk and recognizing cultural identity.
Rea-Dickins, P. (2001) 'Mirror, Mirror on the Wall: Identifying Processes of Classroom Assessment'. <i>Language Testing</i> , 18:4, 429-62.	Focuses on classroom assessment in an EAL school context – particularly formative assessment	Using the notion of the 'assessment cycle' as a starting point, it employs teacher interviews, classroom observation, video and audio recordings of learners and lesson transcripts.	Traces different stages in the teacher assessment process and posits a model for the analysis of teacher decision-making for the purposes of assessment.	Asks questions at the end, including 'Are teachers in an EAL context able to distinguish between a language learning need, a special educational need and a curriculum content need?'
Rea-Dickins, P. (2006) 'Currents and eddies in the discourse of assessment: a learning-focused interpretation'. <i>International Journal of Applied Linguistics</i> , 16:2, 163-188	Explores processes of classroom assessment in an EAL context at the interface of assessment practices and second language acquisition.	Transcripts of teacher-learner interactions are the basis for an analysis of teacher feedback, learner-responses to this feedback, as well as learner-initiated talk.	There are different teacher orientations within assessment; there is potential for assessment dialogues as part of language learning. The paper questions whether learners are aware of assessment practices embedded into learning.	Implications are that teachers need to be more sensitive to the potential for learning that is embedded in assessment practices, whether formative or summative.

Reference for study	Focus of study (EAL, ELL), including age group if noted	Research methodology and methods used	Pedagogy and/or impact – results	Nature and/or efficacy of the teacher workforce – results and implications
<p>Robertson, L.H. (2006) 'Learning to read properly by moving between parallel literacy classes'. <i>Language and Education</i>, 20:1, 44-61. (abstract only)</p>	<p>This paper explores what kinds of advantages and strengths the process of learning to read simultaneously in different languages and scripts might bring about. It is based on a socio-cultural view of learning and literacy and examines early literacy in three parallel literacy classes in Watford, England.</p>	<p>It analyses the learning experiences of five bilingual children who are of second or third generation Pakistani background. At the start of the study the children are five years old and they attend the same school and class.</p>	<p>The data shows that the children learn to switch between three literacy systems. They talk about their literacy learning in terms of 'how you got to do it' and 'do it properly', which varies from class to class. They use a different range of learning strategies in establishing how to read with meaning.</p>	<p>Rather than finding these – or the different related languages and scripts – confusing, they have a powerful impact in enabling the children to see literacies as systems that change and that can be manipulated. This kind of analytical approach of understanding 'proper' reading is based on the children's varied experiences of parallel literacy classes.</p>

Reference for study	Focus of study (EAL, ELL), including age group if noted	Research methodology and methods used	Pedagogy and/or impact – results	Nature and/or efficacy of the teacher workforce – results and implications
<p>Robinson, P. (2005) 'Teaching key vocabulary in geography and science classrooms: an analysis of teachers' practice with particular reference to EAL pupils' learning'. <i>Language and Education</i>, 19:5, 428-45.</p>	<p>This paper discusses findings from research conducted in an inner-city middle school in England where the majority of pupils spoke languages other than English as a first language. The research was motivated both by a belief that the language needs of English as an additional language (EAL) pupils are not properly addressed in the National Curriculum and by a specific concern of the subject teachers that the EAL pupils' small English vocabularies resulted in their lack of oral participation in lessons and contributed to their below average attainment.</p>	<p>Thick description of a large quantity of unstructured data.</p>	<p>The paper discusses the effects on the pupils' learning of subject teachers' practices in teaching key vocabulary in science and geography lessons.</p>	<p>It argues that a more explicit, systematic and principled approach to vocabulary teaching needs to be integrated into National Curriculum pedagogy.</p>

Reference for study	Focus of study (EAL, ELL), including age group if noted	Research methodology and methods used	Pedagogy and/or impact – results	Nature and/or efficacy of the teacher workforce – results and implications
<p>Ryu, J. (2004) 'The Social Adjustment of Three, Young, High-Achieving Korean-English Bilingual Students in Kindergarten'. <i>Early Childhood Education Journal</i>, 32:3 165-171.</p>	<p>Three young, high-achieving Korean pupils in a kindergarten school in Cambridge MA.</p>	<p>Observations and interviews in a natural setting.</p>	<p>Teachers and parents play an important role in helping young pupils to adjust.</p>	<p>Mainstream teachers are very important, and need to understand Korean culture; at minimum, they need to know a few Korean words and – in this case – be sensitive to the needs of gifted children. Language support and mainstream teachers need to work closely together, and with parents.</p>
<p>Scott, C. (2007) 'Stakeholder Perceptions of Test Impact'. <i>Assessment in Education: Principles, Policy & Practice</i>, 14:1, 27-49. (abstract only)</p>	<p>The impact of statutory testing in the UK primary school context on learners of English as an Additional Language.</p>	<p>The findings relate to stakeholder perceptions and are predominantly drawn from inductive analysis of interview data with key stakeholders: teachers, learners and parents, as well as an extensive review of relevant literature.</p>	<p>The findings are discussed in relation to the uses to which test data are put, the stakes for the school, teachers and learners, and parents and learners' understanding of the purposes of the tests and the meaning of levels. On the basis of the analysis, it is argued that, whilst the tests are not necessarily without value, particularly to the school, care needs to be taken in arguing that test scores are informative to parents and that there are no adverse affects on primary age learners.</p>	<p>[Not clear, as full text not available]</p>

Reference for study	Focus of study (EAL, ELL), including age group if noted	Research methodology and methods used	Pedagogy and/or impact – results	Nature and/or efficacy of the teacher workforce – results and implications
Scott, C. and Erduran, S. (2004) 'Learning from international frameworks for assessment: EAL descriptors in Australia and the USA'. <i>Language Testing</i> , 21:3, 409-431.	Focuses on assessment frameworks in the USA and Australia, where EAL is measured separately from 'English' or other native language competences.	Comparative critical evaluation.	The frameworks highlight the distinctiveness of EAL learning, and are sensitive to the needs of different EAL groups and indeed individuals.	Much could be learnt from practice in this area for the UK context, where, at present, EAL assessment is subsumed within 'English'.
Teasdale, A. and Leung C. (2000) 'Teacher Assessment and Psychometric Theory: A Case of Paradigm Crossing?' <i>Language Testing</i> , 17:2, 163-84.	Addresses epistemic and practical issues surrounding alternative testing regimes in EAL contexts.	Critical evaluation	Suggests there are problems with classroom-based language assessment, particularly with EAL learners, if learning and language achievement are not separated.	Argues for context sensitivity with regard to the assessment of language achievement and learning in the EAL context.
Varghese, M. and Stritikus, T. (2005) "'Nadie me dijo [Nobody told me]": Language policy negotiation and implications for teacher education'. <i>Journal of Teacher Education</i> , 56:1, 73-87.	Nationwide and statewide shifts in language policy in education have created instability and uncertainty in teachers' minds.	Cross-case study and analysis of bilingual teachers in two states: California and Pennsylvania.	Teachers were aware of policy at national and local levels. They saw this as part of their professional responsibility; though there were inevitable gaps.	Teachers need to be aware of language policy as well as being good at pedagogy. The article argues for initial and continuing teacher education to embrace language <i>policy</i> as well as content and methods.

Reference for study	Focus of study (EAL, ELL), including age group if noted	Research methodology and methods used	Pedagogy and/or impact – results	Nature and/or efficacy of the teacher workforce – results and implications
<p>Wallace, C. (2005) 'Conversations Around the Literacy Hour in a Multilingual London Primary School'. <i>Language and Education</i>, 19:4, 322-338.</p>	<p>Focuses on the developing understanding of literacy in four bilingual year 5 children in London, within the context of the Literacy Hour.</p>	<p>Recording and analysis of conversations about the impact of the Literacy Hour on literacy; use of talk about text. Four case study children.</p>	<p>Conversational data is divided into four sets: 'on-task' talk, literacy recounts, literacy performances and literacy worlds. The Literacy Hour is only a small part of a children's experience of, influence on and interest in language.</p>	<p>The full range of children's cultural and cognitive/ linguistic resources needs to be taken into account in any provision that purports to address EAL issues in the classroom.</p>
<p>Wallen, M. and Kelly-Holmes, H. (2006) "I think they just think it's going to go away at some stage": policy and practice in teaching EAL in Irish primary schools'. <i>Language and Education</i>, 20:2, 141-61. (abstract only)</p>	<p>The number of language minority students enrolling in primary schools has increased substantially over the last 10 years. The Irish context is a particularly interesting one in that until recently Ireland was a country of net emigration with limited experience of cultural diversity. An additional factor here is the Irish language, which makes the education system open to bilingualism and encouraging linguistic diversity.</p>	<p>This study looks at how Ireland is responding to these changes in a case study of practice in teaching English as an additional language (EAL) to students in a city in western Ireland.</p>	<p>A review of government policy initiatives in this area reveals that they seem to have been developed primarily in isolation from international models of best practice. Instead, the concern is with reacting to what is considered a temporary issue.</p>	<p>Finally, the case study shows very inconsistent EAL provision for learners in schools and a general under-valuing of the subject and teachers involved in its delivery.</p>

Reference for study	Focus of study (EAL, ELL), including age group if noted	Research methodology and methods used	Pedagogy and/or impact – results	Nature and/or efficacy of the teacher workforce – results and implications
<p>Walters, S. (2007) 'How Do You Know that He's Bright but Lazy? Teachers' Assessments of Bangladeshi English as an Additional Language Pupils in Two Year Three Classrooms'. <i>Oxford Review of Education</i>, 33:1, 87-101. (abstract only)</p>	<p>This article considers how teachers come to assess pupils' needs and abilities and how pupils come to acquire particular identities in the classroom particularly Bangladeshi pupils who are both studying English as an Additional Language (EAL) and are minority ethnic pupils.</p>	<p>Three case studies.</p>	<p>This work is a contribution to an emerging 'sociology of educational assessment' which considers assessment as a social practice. How teachers' understanding of pupils, how their needs as teachers to manage their lessons and how their pupils' actions in presenting themselves as particular kinds of pupils contribute to the achievement and underachievement of minority ethnic and EAL pupils is outlined.</p>	<p>[Not clear, and full text not available]</p>
<p>Waxman, H. and Tellez, K. (2002) <i>Research synthesis on effective teaching practices for English language learners</i>. Philadelphia PA: Mid-Atlantic Lab for Student Success – and see www.temple.edu/LSS.</p>	<p>A study published in 2002 and based on research published between 1990 and 2002.</p>	<p>34 articles included in a final research synthesis, from 100+ potentially relevant articles. Most articles were based on small-scale studies, and most qualitative in data and analysis.</p>	<p>Seven teaching practices were found to be effective: collaborative learning communities; multiple representations; building on prior knowledge; instructional conversation; culturally responsive instruction; cognitively guided instruction; and technology-enriched instruction.</p>	<p>Provides a useful benchmark synthesis for the present map. An extensive number of implications and suggestions for initial and continuing teacher education. Most of these concern a need for increased subject and pedagogic knowledge for teachers, as well as increased cultural sensitivity.</p>

Reference for study	Focus of study (EAL, ELL), including age group if noted	Research methodology and methods used	Pedagogy and/or impact – results	Nature and/or efficacy of the teacher workforce – results and implications
<p>Wiese, A.M. (2004) 'Bilingualism and biliteracy for all?' <i>Language and Education</i>, 18:1, 69-92. (abstract only)</p>	<p>This study unpacks the inherent tension that arises when any school adopts a particular model for reform - how to mesh a model with the reality of daily life in the classroom. In the field of bilingual education, programme models abound, and the literature reflects a great diversity among them, as well as efforts to evaluate their relative effectiveness.</p>	<p>This interpretive, ethnographic study reveals how one particular programme model, two-way immersion, is enacted in the context of Monte Vista Elementary School.</p>	<p>The study illustrates the tension between the two-way immersion model and implementation at the school site. The staff developed a series of school-wide agreements regarding student placement, outcome goals, and literacy instruction. These agreements shaped the nature of literacy instruction, and for one teacher led to a focus on language of instruction rather than rich, authentic literacy events for all students.</p>	<p>The importance of two-way agreements between key stakeholders in the process of language education.</p>
<p>Yoon, B. (2007) 'Offering or Limiting Opportunities: Teachers' Roles and Approaches to English-Language Learners' Participation in Literacy Activities'. <i>Reading Teacher</i>, 61:3, 216-225.</p>	<p>How best to support ELLs in literacy development.</p>	<p>Data collected at a middle school in western New York state. Focus on case studies of two teachers: observation and both formal and informal interviews</p>	<p>Teachers can promote the process by responding to the students' cultural and social needs in a more active manner. Teachers are the principal factor in engagement and success of ELLs. One of the teachers studied was more active in these regards than the other.</p>	<p>Teachers need a combination of pedagogical skills, confidence in their subject and warmth.</p>

Reference for study	Focus of study (EAL, ELL), including age group if noted	Research methodology and methods used	Pedagogy and/or impact – results	Nature and/or efficacy of the teacher workforce – results and implications
<p>Yoon, B. (2008) 'Uninvited guests; the role of teachers' roles and pedagogies on the role and positioning of English language learners in the regular classroom'. <i>American Educational Research Journal</i>, 45:2, 495-522.</p>	<p>Based on positioning theory, this study examines teachers' view of themselves and ELL students in mainstream classrooms.</p>	<p>Collective case study method used to collect material from three teachers in one school in New York State</p>	<p>The teachers' different approaches were related to learners' different levels of participation and their positioning themselves as powerful or powerless students. Teachers' approaches were also based on whether they saw themselves as teachers of all children, as classroom general teachers, or specialist subject teachers.</p>	<p>An implication of this article is that student <i>agency</i> is an important factor in English language learning – and how they see themselves as learners. Further understanding is also needed of what teachers know and believe in their approach to ELLs.</p>

Appendix 3: Search strategy for the review

Electronic resources

In order to identify relevant literature, the following academic databases were searched:

- Education Resources Information Center (ERIC)
- Contains over one million bibliographic records of journals articles, books and book chapters, research reports, conference papers, theses and other education-related materials from 1996 onwards. Includes online thesaurus.
- PsycINFO
- Contains citations and summaries of journal articles, book chapters, books, and technical reports in the field of psychology and psychological aspects of related disciplines, including educational studies. Journal coverage includes international material selected from more than 1,900 periodicals. Current chapter and book coverage includes worldwide English-language material published from 1987-present.
- British Education Index (BEI)
- Indexes over 300 education and training journals published in the UK from 1976 to date. Also contains reports and conference literature.
- Social Sciences Citation Index (SSCI)
- Indexes more than 1,725 journals across 50 social sciences disciplines, and indexes individually selected, relevant items from over 3,300 of the world's leading scientific and technical journals.
- Applied Social Sciences Index and Abstracts (ASSIA)
- Indexes around 650 English language social science journals. Subject coverage includes social services, health, employment, ethnic studies, education, criminology, and related areas.
- The Campbell Library and C2SPECTR
- A database of trials and systematic reviews in the areas of education, criminal justice and social welfare.

Search terms

Keywords and search terms for the electronic searches were developed in accordance with the search parameters set out in the review protocol. These were used in combination as follows:

1. teach* within 3 (method* or strateg*) **or** (teacher or instructional) effectiveness **or** teacher role
2. English within 3 (additional language) **or** EAL **or** English language learners **or** ELL

3. (bilingual or multilingual or plurilingual) within 3 (student* or pupil* or child* or adolescent* or learner*) **or** bilingual education
4. 2 or 3
5. 1 and 4

All of the search terms were used in free text searching. The searches were limited to journal articles, books and book chapters, research reports and conference papers published in English between 2000 and 2008.

Hand searching and expert contact

In addition to searches of electronic resources, a hand search was also conducted, based on the expertise and advice of those within the project team and within NALDIC. The journal *Language and Education* was hand-searched for articles published since 2000.